



CLIMATE CHANGE
ADVISORY COMMITTEE
SPECIAL MEETING
MONDAY, DECEMBER 11, 2017
7:00 – 8:30 PM
CITY HALL
ROOM 139
280 MADISON AVENUE NORTH
BAINBRIDGE ISLAND, WA 98110

AGENDA

Members: Derik Broekhoff
Michael Cox
Lara Hansen
Gary Lagerloef
David McCaughey

Nora Ferm Nickum
Deborah Rudnick
James Rufo-Hill
Jane Silberstein

Liaison: Councilmember Kol Medina

7:00 Call meeting to Order

7:05 Discussion and approval of minutes

7:10 Public Comment

7:20 Old Business – Report Outs

- GHG Inventory Recommendations – **Final Review**
- OPMA Applicability to Committee
- City response to table on actions to implement climate change elements in Comprehensive Plan – **Comments on Matrix**
- Waste subcommittee
- Transportation subcommittee
- Electrical generation subcommittee – **Recommendation on Steve Johnson Request**
- Adaptation subcommittee

8:00 New Business

8:15 Other Business

8:30 Adjourn

MINUTES

Present: Committee members Derik Broekhoff, Michael Cox, Lara Hansen, Gary Lagerloef, David McCaughey, Nora Ferm Nickum, Deborah Rudnick, James Rufo-Hill, Jane Silberstein; Senior City Planner Christy Carr and Public Works Director Barry Loveless

1. Call to order
 - The meeting was called to order at 6:16 pm.
2. Approval of minutes
 - Minutes from the previous meeting (October 18, 2017) were approved.
3. Public comment
 - Erika Shriner shared her thoughts about the bridge and walkability. She encouraged this Committee to consider commenting on the bridge.
4. Old business: Request to City to complete table on actions to implement climate change elements in Comprehensive Plan.
 - City staff filled out the table, and Public Works Director Barry Loveless and City Planner Christy Carr attended the first part of the meeting to answer questions. We learned that:
 - The City has thought about some roads that may be exposed to sea level rise (e.g., Country Club Road, Crystal Springs, Eagle Harbor) but hasn't done a comprehensive study.
 - Under the stormwater permit, the City was required to integrate low impact development elements. This will be helpful in the context of increased extreme precipitation.
 - The Comprehensive Plan is prompting the City to consider doing more in terms of beneficial reuse of wastewater. The City doesn't have a biodigester or methane flare, so some options are currently off the table.
 - The Council has adopted a list of plans, policies, and regulations that can be relied upon to assign mitigation measures to a project. The Comprehensive Plan is on the list, so the climate change policies in that Plan can be applied to projects.

- The Critical Areas Ordinance is slated to be approved by Council at the end of November. There wasn't methodical consideration of climate change in that process. It came up in a couple of places: considering buffers for fish-bearing streams, and the potential for increased landslides under climate change.
- Bainbridge Island's Shoreline Master Program (SMP) is dated 2014. It doesn't really address sea level rise even though some Department of Ecology guidance on that topic was available as of 2010. The City is starting the first phase of the SMP amendment now, and this could be an opportunity to look strategically at climate change. There will be opportunities to comment on the SMP process throughout 2018.
- The Island Center Subarea Plan will be updated in 2018 and the Winslow Master Plan will be updated in 2019. The subdivision standards will also be revised soon. This Committee could comment on how to integrate climate change considerations into those planning processes.
- The City is investigating the potential to have a green building standard, which would intersect with climate change.
- Potential Committee activities:
 - The Committee could make recommendations to the Council with regard to an overall framework for Comprehensive Plan implementation.
 - The Committee could support City staff in making progress on climate change per the Comprehensive Plan by providing examples of what other utilities and cities are doing to advance climate change mitigation and adaptation. This could include examples of climate-friendly land use patterns, building standards, and subarea plans. Staff may also find it helpful for the Committee to advise on what the top near-term priorities should be.
- Homework:
 - Committee members will look back through the table and identify high priorities for Committee recommendations, using criteria shared by the co-chairs.

5. GHG inventory

- The Greenhouse Gas Inventory Subcommittee presented a draft recommendation document. The subcommittee will update the recommendation document based on tonight's discussion.

6. Reports from other subcommittees

- Last month, the Committee established three new subcommittees to gather and report back on best practices for climate change mitigation that are applicable to Bainbridge Island. These subcommittees (on waste, transportation, and electrical generation) reported out at this meeting.
- These subcommittees will consider adaptation as well as mitigation.

7. Other business

- An RFP is under development to obtain the services of a consultant to guide visioning and planning for the Island Center Subarea. The Committee recommends to the Council that the RFP explicitly state that climate change considerations must be part of the planning process. The co-chairs will share this recommendation with the Council liaison and ask for a copy of the draft RFP to suggest language. Lara, Nora, and Michael are on a new temporary subcommittee to work on this.
- The Committee discussed a letter from Stephen Johnson suggesting a recommendation that the City Council pass a resolution tasking the City Manager with requiring that PSE submit an annual report on the tonnage of carbon produced by company power plants (historical data and forecasts to 2035).
- Gary Lagerloef and James Rufo-Hill talked about their outreach experience this week at Grace Episcopal Church, and the value of doing additional proactive outreach in the community. We will brainstorm a list of potential speaking opportunities on the island.

8. Meeting adjourned

- The meeting was adjourned at 8:20 pm.

Climate Change Advisory Committee
Recommendations for Completing a Greenhouse Gas Inventory
(December 6th, 2017)

Section 1: Recommendations

The CCAC makes two recommendations in relation to completing a greenhouse gas (GHG) inventory:

1. The City Council should affirm the following two goals that are already contained in the City's Comprehensive Plan or Council resolutions: (A) The City will meet or exceed the existing commitments the City has made in relation to GHG reductions; (B) The City will, following completion of a GHG inventory, identify discrete emission reduction targets in specific source sectors.
2. The City Council should authorize the CCAC, in consultation with City Staff, to take the steps necessary to complete a GHG inventory including authorizing the expenditure of funds needed to join ICLEI and hire a consultant to complete the GHG inventory.

Section 2: Background

The Climate Change Advisory Committee (CCAC) was created by the City Council under BIMC 2.37. Section 2.37.030 directs the CCAC to do the following, among other actions:

C(1): Provide advice and/or recommendations to the city council or city staff, as appropriate, on methods of completing a baseline island-wide greenhouse gas (GHG) inventory for the city.

C(2): To the degree directed by the city council, assist with or manage the completion of a baseline island-wide GHG inventory

The following document provides recommendations on conducting a GHG inventory (C(1)) and discussions how the CCAC could assist with or manage the GHG inventory (C(2)). The document contains three sections. Section 3 provides a summary of recommendations for completing a GHG inventory. Section 4 provides a more in-depth discussion of the deliberation by the CCAC on the GHG inventory. Section 5 discusses next steps in general for the CCAC and specifically the GHG inventory. Appendix A provides an update on the progress of the CCAC including a workplan for our first year.

Section 3: Summary of GHG Inventory Recommendations

The CCAC is requesting that the City Council authorize initiating a GHG inventory with the details provided below.

- The inventory should cover both City operations and the community at large.
- The City should join ICLEI and utilize their “US Community Protocol for Accounting and Reporting GHG Emissions” for conducting the inventory. The cost to join ICLEI is \$600/year.
- The City should contract out the initial inventory. The CCAC estimates the GHG inventory could cost \$10,000 - \$15,000 and take 1-3 months from the time the contract is approved. The costs would be on the lower end of that range if the City can help collect and organize the data.
- The CCAC will work with City staff to minimize the time they need to work on the GHG inventory by the following: 1) assist in the development of a request for proposal; 2) review applicants; 3) work with the selected contractor to complete the inventory; 4) oversee work of contractor as appropriate; and 5) review and comment on draft reports.
- The inventory should be updated every three years by City staff.

Section 4: Discussion

When developing a GHG inventory there are several questions that must be addressed. Each of these questions is discussed below along with the options considered, a discussion of each option, and the rationale for selecting the option.

Question 1: What are we trying to achieve?

The CCAC believes it is important to establish concrete goals for what we are trying to achieve on the Island in terms of addressing climate change and reducing GHG emissions. An overarching goal should be to meet or exceed the existing commitments the City has made in relation to GHG reductions, including but not limited to the Paris Agreement and the U.S. Conference of Mayors Climate Protection Agreement.

After completing the GHG inventory, the City should identify discrete emission reduction targets in specific GHG source sectors (e.g., transportation and land use; energy supply; building energy consumption; water and waste management; and forestry).

Question 2: How will the inventory be used?

This question is important because it helps address why we are doing the inventory. The committee believes there are multiple reasons for completing a GHG inventory as indicated in Table 1.

Table 1: How will the inventory be used?

Objectives	Discussion
Help establish GHG reduction targets	The inventory is critical information for establishing GHG reduction targets. Targets are important to provide tangible goals for reducing GHGs.
Inform City policies	The inventory can be used to identify those sectors where the majority of GHGs are produced. This can help the City target those areas that would be the most important to address in terms of reducing GHGs.
Educate citizens	The inventory can be used to provide citizens guidance on areas where they can reduce their GHGs.
Work with other jurisdictions	The inventory can help if the City Council decides the City should participate in regional climate change efforts.

Question 3: What is the scope for the inventory?

This question is important because it helps define what will be addressed in the inventory. The committee believes it is important that the scope includes an inventory that covers both City operations and the community as a whole as outlined in Table 2. This would also include the other taxing authorities on the Island (i.e., schools, parks, fire, and library).

Table 2: What is the scope for the inventory?

Objectives	Discussion
City Operations	City operations are crucial because the City Council and City Manager are authorized to make changes.
Community wide	To be more relevant to Island residents the inventory needs to include community emissions. While the City has limited control over the actions of individual citizens, it can provide education and incentives for citizens to reduce their GHG emissions. It will also be important to bring in the other taxing jurisdictions: schools, parks, fire, and library.
County wide	Fortunately, a Kitsap County GHG inventory has been completed for the Puget Sound Clean Air Agency by Cascadia Consulting though it is not yet published. It does not disaggregate the GHG emissions from Bainbridge Island, but it could be used as a comparison with results from the BI inventory especially with respect to per capita GHG emissions.

Question 4: What type of inventory?

There are two basic types of inventories: geographic-based and consumption-based. A geographic-based inventory accounts for all the GHG emissions released within a specific geographic boundary and can include other emissions outside the boundary such as those associated with air travel and electricity generation. A consumption-based inventory takes into account the embedded emissions in the goods and services a community consumes such as the production, transport, sale, use, and disposal of goods and services – no matter where they are produced.

The committee believes that the best approach is to use both types of inventories. We suggest using the geographic-based as the main approach but supplement that with information from consumption-based inventories that have been completed by King County and other entities.

Table 3: What type of inventory?

Options	Discussion
Geographic Based	The geographic-based is the most widely utilized with excellent protocols for completing. It does not capture the actions of individuals as well as the consumption-based inventory.
Consumption Based	The consumption-based inventory is useful for helping communicate how individual's choices are driving GHG emissions better than geographic based inventory. While these inventories have been completed (e.g., King County) the protocols for completing them are not as robust.
Hybrid	A hybrid approach is possible by completing a geographic-based inventory and using existing information available (e.g., Cool Climate Berkeley and King County) to provide rough estimates on consumption related to GHG emissions.

Question 5: What protocol do we use?

There are several standard protocols that could be followed. The advantage of following a standard protocol is to: 1) make the process more rigorous and in some cases, maybe a bit easier, to the extent you don't have to figure everything from scratch; and 2) be able to formally report GHG emissions to various initiatives or registries (e.g., the Climate Disclosure Project). The committee believes the best protocol is the ICELI Community Protocol because it is well established, and it covers both City operations and community-wide emissions.

Table 4: What protocol to follow to complete inventory?

Options	Discussion
Global Protocol for Community-Scale	This is the gold standard. It provides detailed reporting consistent with the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change guidelines. It

Options	Discussion
Emissions.	requires reporting on 8 categories of GHGs, 22 sectors, and 3 different scopes. It is useful if you want to report GHG emissions internationally, and join various “mayor” alliances on climate change. This protocol is expensive and beyond what we need.
ICLEI – Community Protocol for Accounting and Reporting GHG Emissions.	The inventory provides detailed, focused guidance on completing a GHG emission inventory in the USA. It includes emissions from businesses, residents, and transportation and is relatively low cost.
ICLEI – Local Government Operations Protocol	This inventory provides detailed guidance on accounting for emissions from the buildings, facilities and vehicles operated by a local government. This protocol is focused on local governments only and therefore insufficient for our needs.

Question 6: What are the costs and timeframes to complete?

The CCAC recommends contracting out the completion of the GHG inventory for several reasons.

- City staff do not have the time or expertise to complete the inventory,
- The inventory would be completed in a more timely fashion (1-3 months from the time of contract approval) if contracted out.
- The most difficult and time consuming task of an inventory is the collection and organization of the data. There are several firms who have used the ICLEI protocol and know where to find the necessary data.
- While the members of the CCAC can assist in all aspects of the process (e.g., developing RFP, selection of contractor, oversight of contractor, and review of reports), the members do not have the time to complete the inventory.
- It is critical that the initial inventory is of high quality, timely, and objective.

The costs for a geographic-based inventory for a community the size of Bainbridge is estimated to be between \$10,000 - 15,000 and will take 1-3 months to complete from the time the contract is approved. The costs would be lower if the City can help collect and organize the data. The CCAC would work with the contractor to incorporate the consumption-based inventory.

In terms of City staff time, it is difficult to estimate an exact number of City staff hours needed, but the CCAC will help minimize the Staff time as much as possible.

- CCAC can draft the RFP, but staff will need to be involved in reviewing.

- At least one staff member will need to be on the RFP review panel along with CCAC members. To ensure the proposals are short, we can limit the number of pages per proposal (e.g., 5 pages). The number of hours will depend on the number of proposals.
- A staff person would need to manage the contract and be the point of contact.
- A staff person would need to review draft reports, but the majority of review could be completed by CCAC members.

Section 5: Next Steps

CCAC members are available to brief the City Council on our recommendations. In the interim, we will continue to work on identifying the best management practices for reducing GHGs on the Island, working with City staff to better understand how they are addressing the elements in the Comprehensive Plan related to climate change including how the CCAC can assist them, and start working on a community-wide education program on climate change in collaboration with existing organizations.

Appendix A: Status of CCAC - The CCAC has held four meetings and has accomplished the following:

- Developed a workplan for our first year (see below);
- Initiated a process to develop a better understanding of how the City is currently addressing the areas of the Comprehensive Plan related to climate change and had an initial conversation with City staff;
- Reached out to the City to determine how to make our working documents and deliberations accessible and transparent to the public;
- Established four subcommittees to identify/explore best practices for reducing GHG emissions in the waste, transportation, and electrical generation sectors and a subcommittee on climate adaptation across all sectors; and
- Developed recommendations for City Council consideration for moving forward with completing a GHG inventory.

Climate Change Advisory Committee Workplan

Task	Goal	Actions	Timeline
1	GHG Inventory recommendation	• Explore options of scope and process • Consider how to link to other community values • Make recommendation to City Council	December 2017
2	Assist/manage baseline inventory	• Review option selected by Council • Advise on process • Review interim products (e.g., workplan, assumptions)	TBD based on Council timeframe
3	Provide advice/recommendations related to City GHG emission reduction targets	• Determine goal for target (%, components) • Evaluate pathway to meet target • Determine metrics for monitoring progress	January - June 2018
4	Work with City Staff, as appropriate, to complete and recommend to the city council a city climate action plan and implementation policy	• Determine goal for plan • Assess existing elements in established plans • Recommend how best to meet goal and monitor progress	November 2017 – June 2018

Task	Goal	Actions	Timeline
5	Provide advice and/or recommendations to the City Council or City staff, as appropriate, on how to measure progress toward meeting the City's GHG emissions reduction targets and adaptation actions	• Review inventory of targets and action commitments • Recommend process for implementation • Recommend metrics for monitoring progress	January – June 2018
6	Assist the City with participation in regional climate change efforts	• Review inventory of current city commitments and regional opportunities • Evaluate these are achievable and meet our existing targets and goals • Recommend metrics for monitoring progress	February 2018
7	Provide education and outreach to the public regarding the committee and the City relating to climate change	• Consider traditional avenues • Consider novel avenues that merge non-traditional partnerships (e.g., art and climate with BPA or BIMA)	On-going, plan for 1 st event in early 2018

From: Stephen Johnson <stevej7775@gmail.com>

Sent: Wednesday, November 1, 2017 11:02 AM

To: Michael Cox; Lara Hansen

Cc: Randal Samstag

Subject: Fwd: Powerful Actions by the COBI Climate Change Advisory Committee

Dear Climate Change Advisory Committee Co Chairs

As you work on climate issues and the city's role in addressing them there is one thing essential to showing the city is serious about addressing climate change's existential threat: the city should require PSE to make annual reports on its carbon production. I suggest the following approach:

The COBI grants to PSE a franchise to provide electric service on the island. In granting this franchise the city takes on a significant responsibility for the actions of PSE in particular with respect to the company's contribution to global warming.

At present PSE generates the majority of its power with carbon based fuels, and is the states largest producer of atmospheric carbon outside of the transportation sector. The company's current draft Integrated Resource Plan indicates it intends to continue this commitment to carbon based fuels at the same high levels until 2035, absent additional government action or regulation. The the company's current franchise expires in 2022. The purpose of this action is to determine whether PSE is acting to significantly reduce its contribution to global warming or not.

City Resolution

The city council, cognizant of its commitment to decreasing the island's contribution to global warming, tasks the city manager with requiring PSE to make an annual documented report as follows:

PSE's Contributions to Global Warming and Production of Atmospheric Carbon

PSE is asked to provide the COBI the following reports, information and supporting documents on April 1, 2018 (for calendar year 2017) and every April 1 thereafter until April 1, 2022:

- 1. The tonnage of carbon produced by company power plants, and contract power purchases whether produced inside or outside Washington State (in other words all the power plant created carbon it produces) for the previous calendar year.***
- 2. A table of its annual carbon production for the previous 10 years, and a similar table forecasting its carbon production until 2035 per its Integrated Resource Plan.***
- 3. Its current plans for carbon production independent of government actions that may be forecast or speculated will occur. This is not to include actions customers make take in developing green resources or purchasing green power credits.***

It would also be useful and appropriate to expand this annual reporting requirement into other aspects of PSE's service, for example providing the city with a copy of its annual report to the WUTC on reliability, with analysis specific to Bainbridge Island. Analysis done by Randal Samstag shows that reliability on the island is significantly worse than other parts of PSE's service area and 3 to 5 times worse than comparable public power utilities such as Snohomish PUD. My one concern is that this not take away from the importance of the climate issue

Few of us in our working lives were not required to face an annual evaluation or fitness report. In most cases this involves evaluating performance with respect to past goals, and setting goals for the following year. As a corporation franchised by the city, that takes annual revenues of more than 22 million dollars from the island, PSE's performance should be subjected to the same standard.

I would be happy to discuss this idea with your committee or ask my colleague Randal Samstag do so.

Respectively submitted

Steve Johnson
Lytle Road
206-484-9499