



CLIMATE CHANGE
ADVISORY COMMITTEE
WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 15, 2017
6:15 – 8:15 PM
CITY HALL
COUNCIL CONFERENCE ROOM
280 MADISON AVENUE NORTH
BAINBRIDGE ISLAND, WA 98110

AGENDA

Members: Derik Broekhoff Nora Ferm Nickum
 Michael Cox Deborah Rudnick
 Lara Hansen James Rufo-Hill
 Gary Lagerloef Jane Silberstein
 David McCaughey

Liaison: Councilmember Kol Medina

6:15 Call meeting to Order

6:20 Discussion and approval of minutes

6:25 Public Comment

6:35 Old Business – Report Outs

- Request to council liaison to consider changes to OPMA Applicability to Committee (part of Ordinance establishing Committee (BIMC 2.37)
- Request to City to complete table on actions to implement climate change elements in Comprehensive Plan
- GHG inventory subcommittee
- Waste subcommittee
- Transportation subcommittee
- Electrical generation subcommittee

7:30 New Business

- Proposed resolution to City Council on PSE reporting
- New Co-Chair

7:45 Other Business

8:15 Adjourn

MINUTES

Present: Committee members Derik Broekhoff, Gary Lagerloef, Michael Cox, Nora Ferm Nickum, Deborah Rudnick, James Rufo-Hill, Jane Silberstein; Council member Kol Medina

On the phone: David McCaughey

Absent: Lara Hansen

1. Call to order
 - The meeting was called to order at 6:15 pm.
2. Approval of minutes
 - Minutes from the previous meeting (September 20, 2017) were approved.
3. Public comment
 - One member of the public attended and introduced herself.
4. Open Public Meetings Act
 - The Committee discussed ways to make our working documents and deliberations accessible and transparent to the public. Making Committee correspondence available to the public will ensure that the Committee is in compliance with the OPMA when conducting discussions in between monthly in-person meetings.
 - James Rufo-Hill will look into options such as Google Groups, which would allow anyone to subscribe. The Committee will work with the City to make the link available to the public.
5. Recommended changes to the ordinance
 - The Committee had an opportunity to recommend changes to the ordinance that established the Committee, with a deadline of October 31. The Committee decided not to recommend any changes to the ordinance.
6. Request to City to complete table on actions to implement climate change elements in Comprehensive Plan
 - After the September 20 meeting, the co-chairs asked the Council Liaison to transmit a table for City Staff and/or Departments to complete on how they are currently addressing the areas of the Comprehensive Plan dealing with climate change. A senior planner in the Planning Department has been tasked with ensuring that the table is filled out. The Committee will invite the senior planner to attend its November meeting.

-
-
7. Greenhouse gas inventory
 - The Greenhouse Gas Inventory Subcommittee provided a report-out from their meetings.
 - The Greenhouse Gas Inventory Subcommittee will develop a draft recommendation document for Committee discussion.
 8. Formation of additional subcommittees
 - The Committee established three new subcommittees to gather and report back on best practices for climate change mitigation that are applicable to Bainbridge Island:
 - i. Waste (David McCaughey, Lara Hansen)
 - ii. Transportation (Deb Rudnick, Jane Silberstein, James Rufo-Hill)
 - iii. Electrical generation (David McCaughey, Derik Broekhoff, Gary Lagerloef)
 9. Other business
 - The Committee received an invitation to an event on *Climate Change & Security: Issues and Perspectives for the Pacific Northwest*. David McCaughey will attend on behalf of the Committee.
 - Information was shared about a Bainbridge Island Climate and Energy Forum event on October 21 from 10-11:30 am at Eagle Harbor Congregational Church. The event is open to the public. More details are available at BainbridgelslandForum.org.
 - Michael Cox announced that he will be moving and therefore will have to leave the Committee and the co-chair position. The Committee requests that the Council name a new ninth member of the Committee from the original list of applicants. Lara Hansen, current co-chair, will be chair of the Committee.
 10. Meeting adjourned
 - The meeting was adjourned at 7:56 pm.

Michael Cox, Co-Chair 11/15/17

Lara Hansen, Co-Chair 11/15/17

Climate Change Advisory Committee
Draft Recommendations for Completing a Greenhouse Gas Inventory
(November 13th, 2017)

The Climate Change Advisory Committee (CCAC) was created by the City Council under BIMC 2.37. Section 2.37.030 directs the CCAC to:

C(1): Provide advice and/or recommendations to the city council or city staff, as appropriate, on methods of completing a baseline island-wide greenhouse gas (GHG) inventory for the city.

C(2): To the degree directed by the city council, assist with or manage the completion of a baseline island-wide GHG inventory

The following paper provides recommendations on conducting a GHG inventory (C(1)) and discussions how the CCAC could assist with or manage the GHG inventory (C(2)). The paper contains four sections. Section 1 provides an update on the progress of the CCAC. Section 2 provides recommendations for completing a GHG inventory. Section 3 provides a more in-depth discussion of the deliberation by the CCAC on the GHG inventory. Section 4 discusses next steps in general for the CCAC and specifically the GHG inventory.

Section 1: Status of CCAC

The CCAC has held four meetings and have accomplished the following:

- Developed a workplan for our first year (Appendix 1);
- Initiated a process to develop a better understanding of how the city is currently addressing the areas of the Comprehensive Plan related to climate change;
- Reached out to the City to determine how to make our working documents and deliberations accessible and transparent to the public;
- Established three subcommittees to evaluate the best practices for reducing GHG emissions in the waste, transportation, and electrical generation sectors; and
- Developed recommendations for moving forward with completing a GHG inventory (Section 2 below).

The completion of a climate action and implementation plan is composed of different milestones. The first milestone is the completion of a GHG inventory. A GHG inventory will assist in meeting the other milestone. For example, establishing GHG reduction targets is contingent on understanding the baseline GHG emissions and the major sources of those emissions. It can also help in developing strategies for reducing GHGs which will assist in the development of a climate plan.



Section 2: GHG Inventory Recommendation

The CCAC recommends the following related to completing a GHG inventory.

1. In order to provide direction for the climate change initiative, the City should establish two overall goals.

- A goal for City operations of becoming carbon neutral by a date established after the completion of the GHG inventory.
- A goal for the Community to transition to 100% clean and renewable energy by a date established after the completion of the GHG inventory.

2. The City Council should authorize initiating a GHG inventory for the reasons cited above and with the details provided below.

- The inventory should cover both city operations and the community at large.
- The city should join ICLEI and utilize their “US Community Protocol for Accounting and Reporting GHG Emissions” for conducting the inventory. The cost to join ICLEI is \$600/year.
- The City should contract out the initial inventory. The CCAC estimates the GHG inventory would cost \$10 - \$15,000 and take 1-3 months to complete. The costs would be lower if the City can help collect and organize the data.
- The CCAC will work with City staff, as appropriate, to develop a request for proposal, review applicants, work with the selected contractor to complete the inventory, and review draft reports.
- The inventory should be updated every three years by City staff.

Section 3: Discussion

When developing a GHG inventory there are several questions that must be addressed. Each of these questions is discussed below along with the options considered, a discussion of each option, and the rationale for selecting the option.

Question 1: What are we trying to achieve?

The CCAC believes it is important to establish a goal of what we are trying to achieve on the Island in terms of addressing climate change. We recommend establishing a goal for City operations and a goal for the community. The goal for City operations would be to become carbon neutral by a date established after completion of the GHG inventory. The goal for the Community would be to transition to 100% clean and renewable energy by a date established after completion of the GHG inventory. It is important to wait until after the completion of the GHG inventory to provide a reality check on how easy or hard it might be to meet these goals and by when.

Question 2: How will the inventory be used?

This question is important because it helps address why we are doing the inventory. The committee believes there are multiple reasons for completing a GHG inventory as indicate in Table 1.

Table 1: How will the inventory be used?

Options	Discussion	Recommendation
Help establish GHG reduction targets.	The inventory is critical information for establishing GHG reduction targets. Targets are important to provide tangible goals for reducing GHGs.	We believe all of the options are valuable on how to use the inventory.
Inform City policies	The inventory can be used to identify those sectors where the majority of GHGs are produced. This can help the city target those areas that would be the most important to address in terms of reducing GHGs.	
Educate citizens	The inventory can be used to provide citizens guidance on areas where they can reduce their GHGs	
Work with other jurisdictions	The inventory can help if we decide to work with other jurisdictions on reducing GHGs	

Question 3: What is the scope for the inventory

This question is important because it helps define what will be addressed in the inventory. The committee believes it is important that the scope includes an inventory that covers both City operations and the Community as a whole as outlined in Table 2. This would also include the other taxing authorities on the Island (i.e., schools, parks, fire, and library).

Table 2: What is the scope for the inventory?

Options	Discussion	Recommendation
City Operations.	City operations are crucial because it is something that the City Council and City Manager have some control over changing.	We recommend that the inventory covers both city and community wide emissions.
Community wide.	To be more relevant to Island residents the inventory needs to include the Community emissions. While the City has limited control over individual's citizens actions, it can provide education and incentives for citizens to reduce their GHG emissions. It will also be important to bring in the other taxing jurisdictions: schools, parks, fire, and library.	
County wide	Fortunately, a Kitsap county GHG inventory has been completed for the Puget Sound Clean Air Agency by Cascadia Consulting but is not yet published. It does not disaggregate the GHG emissions from Bainbridge Island, but it could be used as a comparison of the results from the BI inventory	

Question 4: What type of inventory?

There are two basic types of inventories: geographic based and consumption based. A geographic based inventory accounts for all the GHG emissions released within a specific geographic boundary and can include other emissions outside the boundary such as those associated with air travel and electricity generation. A consumption based inventory takes into account the embedded emissions in the goods and services a community consumes such as the production, transport, sale, use, and disposal of goods and services – no matter where they are produced.

The committee believes that the best approach is to use both types of inventories. We suggest using the geographic based as the main approach but supplement that with information from

consumption based inventories that have been completed by King County and other organizations.

Table 3: What type of inventory?

Options	Discussion	Recommendation
Geographic Based.	The geographic based is the most widely utilized with excellent protocols for completing. It does not capture the actions of individuals as well as the consumption based inventory.	Use the geographic based approach and provide a supplemental section that documents already developed information on consumption.
Consumption Based.	The consumption based inventory is useful for helping communicate how individual's choices are driving GHG emissions better than geographic based inventory. While these inventories have been completed (e.g., King County) the protocols for completing are not as robust.	
Hybrid	A hybrid approach is possible by completing a geographic based inventory and using existing information available (e.g., Cool Climate Berkeley and King County) to provide rough estimates on consumption related to GHG emissions	

Question 5: What protocol do we use?

There are several standard protocols that could be followed. The advantage of following a standard protocol is to: 1) make the process more rigorous and in some cases, maybe a bit easier, to the extent you don't have to figure everything from scratch; and 2) be able to formally report GHG emissions to various initiatives or registries (e.g., the Climate Disclosure Project). The committee believes the best protocol is the ICLEI Community Protocol because it is well established and it covers both City operations and Community-wide emissions.

Table 4: What protocol to follow to complete inventory?

Options	Discussion	Recommendation
Global Protocol for Community-Scale Emissions.	This is the gold standard and provides detailed and demanding reporting consistent with the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change guidelines. It requires reporting on 8 categories of GHGs, 22 sectors, and 3 different scopes. It is useful if	We recommend using the ICLEI community protocol. The Global protocol is expensive and

Options	Discussion	Recommendation
	you want to report GHG emissions internationally, and join various “mayor” alliances on climate change.	beyond what we need and the ICLEI local protocol is focused on local governments only. The City would need to join ICLEI. The annual fee is \$600.
ICLEI – Community Protocol for Accounting and Reporting GHG Emissions.	The inventory provides detailed, focused guidance on completing a GHG emission inventory in the USA. It includes emissions from businesses, residents, and transportation and is relatively low cost.	
ICLEI – Local Government Operations Protocol	This inventory provides detailed guidance on accounting for emissions from the buildings, facilities and vehicles operated by a local government.	

Question 6: What are the costs and timeframes to complete?

The CCAC recommends contracting out the completion of the GHG inventory for several reasons.

- City staff do not have the time or expertise to complete the inventory,
- The inventory would be completed in a timely fashion (1-3 months) if contracted out.
- The most difficult and time consuming task of an inventory is the collection and organization of the data. There are several firms who have used the ICLEI protocol and know where to find the necessary data.
- While the members of the CCAC can assist in all aspects of the process (e.g., developing RFP, selection of contractor, oversight of contractor, and review of reports) the members do not have the time to complete the inventory.
- It is critical that the initial inventory is of high quality, timely, and objective.

The costs for a geographic based inventory for a community the size of Bainbridge is estimated to between \$10-15 and will take 1-3 months to complete. The costs would be lower if the City can help collect and organize the data.

Section 4: Next Steps

CCAC members are available to brief the City Council on our recommendations. In the interim, we will continue to work on identifying the best management practices for reducing GHG on the Island, working with City staff to better understand how they are addressing the elements in the Comprehensive Plan related to climate change and how the CCAC can assist them, and starting working on a community wide education program on climate change.

Appendix 1: Climate Change Advisory Committee Workplan

Task	Goal	Actions	Timeline
1	GHG Inventory recommendation	• Explore options of scope and process • Consider how to link to other community values • Make recommendation	September/October 2017
2	Assist/manage baseline inventory	• Review option selected by council • Advise on process • Review interim products (e.g., workplan, assumptions)	TBD base on council timeframe
3	Provide advice/recommendations related to city GHG emission reduction targets	• Determine goal for target (% , components) • Evaluate pathway to meet target • Determine metrics for monitoring progress	October 2017- June 2018
4	Work with City Staff, as appropriate, to complete and recommend to the city council a city climate action plan and implementation policy	• Determine goal for plan • Assess existing elements in established plans • Recommend how best to meet goal and monitor progress	October 2017 – June 2018
5	Provide advice and/or recommendations to the city council or city staff, as appropriate, on how to measure progress toward meeting the city's GHG emissions reduction targets and adaptation actions	• Review inventory of targets and action commitments • Recommend process for implementation • Recommend metrics for monitoring progress	October 2017 – June 2018
6	Assist the city with participation in regional climate change efforts	• Review inventory of current city commitments and regional opportunities • Evaluate these are achievable and meet our existing targets and goals • Recommend metrics for monitoring progress	November/December 2017
7	Provide education and outreach to the public regarding the committee and the city relating to climate change	• Consider traditional avenues • Consider novel avenues that merge non-traditional partnerships (e.g., art and climate with BPA or BIMA)	On-going, plan for 1 st event in January 2018

From: Stephen Johnson <stevej7775@gmail.com>

Sent: Wednesday, November 1, 2017 11:02 AM

To: Michael Cox; Lara Hansen

Cc: Randal Samstag

Subject: Fwd: Powerful Actions by the COBI Climate Change Advisory Committee

Dear Climate Change Advisory Committee Co Chairs

As you work on climate issues and the city's role in addressing them there is one thing essential to showing the city is serious about addressing climate change's existential threat: the city should require PSE to make annual reports on its carbon production. I suggest the following approach:

The COBI grants to PSE a franchise to provide electric service on the island. In granting this franchise the city takes on a significant responsibility for the actions of PSE in particular with respect to the company's contribution to global warming.

At present PSE generates the majority of its power with carbon based fuels, and is the states largest producer of atmospheric carbon outside of the transportation sector. The company's current draft Integrated Resource Plan indicates it intends to continue this commitment to carbon based fuels at the same high levels until 2035, absent additional government action or regulation. The the company's current franchise expires in 2022. The purpose of this action is to determine whether PSE is acting to significantly reduce its contribution to global warming or not.

City Resolution

The city council, cognizant of its commitment to decreasing the island's contribution to global warming, tasks the city manager with requiring PSE to make an annual documented report as follows:

PSE's Contributions to Global Warming and Production of Atmospheric Carbon

PSE is asked to provide the COBI the following reports, information and supporting documents on April 1, 2018 (for calendar year 2017) and every April 1 thereafter until April 1, 2022:

- 1. The tonnage of carbon produced by company power plants, and contract power purchases whether produced inside or outside Washington State (in other words all the power plant created carbon it produces) for the previous calendar year.***
- 2. A table of its annual carbon production for the previous 10 years, and a similar table forecasting its carbon production until 2035 per its Integrated Resource Plan.***
- 3. Its current plans for carbon production independent of government actions that may be forecast or speculated will occur. This is not to include actions customers make take in developing green resources or purchasing green power credits.***

It would also be useful and appropriate to expand this annual reporting requirement into other aspects of PSE's service, for example providing the city with a copy of its annual report to the WUTC on reliability, with analysis specific to Bainbridge Island. Analysis done by Randal Samstag shows that reliability on the island is significantly worse than other parts of PSE's service area and 3 to 5 times worse than comparable public power utilities such as Snohomish PUD. My one concern is that this not take away from the importance of the climate issue

Few of us in our working lives were not required to face an annual evaluation or fitness report. In most cases this involves evaluating performance with respect to past goals, and setting goals for the following year. As a corporation franchised by the city, that takes annual revenues of more than 22 million dollars from the island, PSE's performance should be subjected to the same standard.

I would be happy to discuss this idea with your committee or ask my colleague Randal Samstag do so.

Respectively submitted

Steve Johnson
Lytle Road
206-484-9499